GUIDANCE FOR EVIDENCES TO BE SUBMITTED FOR ACCREDITATION OF MEDICAL SPECIALIST TRAINING PROGRAMME

Developed by:

Members of the Panel of Assessors Technical Working Group (POATWG), Medical Education Committee (MEC), Malaysian Medical Council (MMC)

Approved by the Malaysian Medical Council:

20 March 2025

INTRODUCTION/PREAMBLE

- This document serves for reference of Panel of Assessors and Educational Training Provider (ETP)

- The list is not intended to be prescriptive or exhaustive, but only for use as a guide for supporting documents

- The list of suggested evidence is available via the Report page of the Evaluation Instrument for Malaysian Standards for Medical Specialist Training, MMC

AREAS AND STANDARDS

AREA 1: PROGRAMME DEVELOPMENT AND DELIVERY	SOURCES OF EVIDENCE
1.1 **Statement of Educational Objectives of Academic Programme and Learning Outcomes**	Statements of vision, mission and educational goals e.g. in prospectus, brochures, programme, annual report and websites
	Documents on the procedure and processes taken by the faculty/school to relate vision, mission and educational goal of institution with the aims, objectives and learning outcomes of the programme (PEOs and PLOs)
	Healthcare manpower reports from Ministry of Health
	Healthcare services planning from Ministry of Health
	Population demographics, national health surveys
	Market survey, needs analysis, programme benchmarking report, survey questionnaire and/or any documents that report feedback from stakeholders or interested parties
	Needs analysis, programme benchmarking report, survey questionnaire and/or any documents that report feedback from stakeholders or interested parties
1.2 **Programme Development: Process, Content, Structure and Teaching-Learning Methods** **(SSR)**	Minutes and membership of curriculum development committee meetings
	Appointment letters and TOR of external advisors/advisory committee and meeting minutes
	Departmental/Faculty meeting minutes/ Board of Studies report
	Meeting minutes with programme head/ course coordinator
	Approval letters from new programme committee, Board of Studies, Senate
	Course outline, course material, curriculum mapping, teaching and course files
	Minutes of meetings with programme head/ course coordinators
	Minutes of meetings with academic staff of the programme
	Minutes of meetings with external stakeholders/evidence of consultation with stakeholders in the development of the curriculum including educational experts
	Documents on the analysis from the feedback of external sources
	Programme handbook
	Policies, processes, and procedures on programme/curriculum design and delivery
	Policy and procedure of private practice
	Working paper of curriculum development or curriculum review approved by the ETP's Senate

	or Academic Board, supported by the departmental meeting minutes.
	Programme documentation with curriculum structure and content that consider programme standards, professional and industry requirements
	Benchmarking reports on good practices in curriculum design delivery.
1.3 **Programme Delivery**	Minutes of meetings with academic staff of the programme
	Minutes of curriculum committee meeting/ Board of Studies report
	Minutes of meetings with trainees of the programme and academic staff
	Trainees timetable
	Trainee handbook, study guide and research project handbook
	Evidence of mentoring system/mentoring
	Documents on the review and evaluation processes of programme and the utilisation of the results
	External examiner - CV, report
	Records of involvement of external stakeholders eg. trainers - meeting minutes, reports
	Employer feedback, survey through alumni
	Policies, processes, and procedures on programme/curriculum design and delivery
	Programme handbook
	Course outline, course material, curriculum mapping, teaching files

AREA 2: ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEE LEARNING	SOURCES OF EVIDENCE
2.1 **Relationship between Assessment and Learning Outcomes**	Examination blueprints, course assessment plan that is constructively aligned to learning outcomes
	Examination papers, tests, project report template, etc
	Examination regulations and procedures - flowchart, vetting committee, second examiner, meeting minutes
	Examination section/unit - academic staff, administrative staff
	Curriculum mapping (learning outcomes vs assessment)
	Exam Board minutes/ curriculum committee minutes
	Evidence on compliance with the Malaysian Qualifications Framework (MQF)
	Policies, guidelines or university circulars on assessment principles, methods and practices
2.2 **Assessment Methods** **(SSR)**	Academic/exam calendar
	Examination papers, tests, project, etc
	Examination formats and distribution of marks, marking scheme rubrics
	Examination regulations/policy/procedures
	Internal and external vetting processes and forms
	Appointments of external examiners and CV
	Meetings with academic staff/examiners
	Meetings with trainees
	Trainee handbook, training portfolios
	External examiner reports
	Letters of appointment and TOR of vetting committee, exam coordinator.
	Policies, guideline or university circulars on credibility, validity, reliability, consistency, currency and fairness of the assessment tools
2.3 **Management of Trainee Assessment**	Minutes of meetings with Programme Head/ Course Coordinator
	Curriculum committee reports/minutes
	Policies, guidelines or university circulars on students' assessment criteria, grading system, appeal, frequency and methods of assessment, passing mark.
	Communication plan or policies on the dissemination of assessment results
	Policy and processes for review of assessment methods, examples of review conducted and action taken.
	Processes and procedures in ensuring the security of assessment documents and records.
	Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) on handling assessment documents and records
	Appeal procedures and records

AREA 3: TRAINEE SELECTION AND SUPPORT SERVICES	SOURCES OF EVIDENCE
3.1 **Trainee Selection** **(SSR)**	Trainee admission policy
	Certificates of full registration, annual practice certificates, temporary practice certificates
	Mechanism or criteria for trainee with other equivalent qualifications
	Trainee admission records
	Individual trainee files
	Interview procedures, if applicable
	Statements of entry requirement - website, brochures, banners
	Sample of interview assessment
	Appeal procedures and records
	Evidence of consideration for special trainees needs including international trainees
	Minutes of meetings on trainee admission
	Minutes of meeting with persons in-charge of admission and selection
	Minutes of meeting involving stakeholders
3.2 **Articulation and Transfer**	Records of articulation, credit transfer and credit exemptions of trainees
	Records of review of those processes
	Criteria and mechanisms for transfer of trainees
	Implementation of ETP credit transfer scheme
	Document on policies and mechanism on student mobility and transfer within and between institutions
3.3 **Trainee Support Services**	Orientation programme – University/ETPand Faculty/Department level
	Evidence of loan offer by ETP (if applicable)
	Minutes of meeting about trainee support service - financial, facilities etc
	Sample of evaluation trainee support services/ data
	Form and data on trainee complaints on trainee support services - evidence action that been taken
	Guidelines on Mentoring and guidelines on trainee conduct/ professionalism
	Meeting with trainees and trainee representative
	Data on counselling and mentorship that has been provided to trainees
	Documents on support services, such as physical, social, financial, recreational and online facilities, academic and non-academic counselling, and health services.
	Organisation chart of the unit that is responsible to provide student support services
	Document on processes and procedures in handling student disciplinary cases

3.4 Trainee Representation and Participation	Minutes of meetings between ETP and trainee representatives
	Policies on trainee/student representation and participation
3.5 Alumni	Minutes of meeting with alumni (where applicable)
	Minutes of meeting in curriculum development (where applicable)
	Other contributions of alumni to trainee development

AREA 4: TRAINERS	SOURCES OF EVIDENCE
4.1 Recruitment and Management (SSR)	Documents on policy, procedure and process of recruitment and selection
	Terms of reference of employment and benefits
	Appointment letters and job description
	Evidence of trainer-to-trainee ratios
	Policy on workload of academic staff and trainers
	Policy or guidelines on staff promotion
	Guidelines on staff appraisal
	Policy on conflict of interest
	Guidelines on code of conduct and disciplinary procedures
	List of academic staff, trainers and CV
	Certificates of full registration, annual practice certificate, specialist registration
	Individual academic staff files
	Teaching portfolio
	Minutes of meetings/engagements with Dean, head of programme and course coordinator
	Academic/trainer manpower plan
4.2 Service and Development	Training roadmap for academic staff
	Policy on trainer development and examples
	Staff development programme records
	Attendance of train-the-trainer workshops
	Policies on conflict of interest and professional conduct, including procedures for handling disciplinary cases
	Records of staff participation in conferences and scholarly activities
	Sample of evaluation for academic staff
	Policy and support for staff - research, publications, conferences, sabbatical
	Examples of trainer community and professional engagements

AREA 5: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	SOURCES OF EVIDENCE
5.1 **Physical Facilities** **(SSR)**	Confirmation on the physical facilities, services and equipment related to the programme are adequate for trainees and academic staff/trainers for teaching and learning
	Hospital annual reports, evidence of case mix and case load relevant to discipline
	Information on utilisation of hospital/health facilities by other universities
	Trainee logbooks
	Evidence of persons in-charge of specific physical facilities such as lab technicians, librarians, and IT staff
	Documents on policy, procedures and guidelines on the use of the various physical facilities
	Minutes of recent meeting concerning facilities
	Evidence that facilities ae safe, well-maintained and up to date, e.g. building maintenance reports, Bomba certificate
	Documents on the reviewing and planning of learning environment in the faculty/school
5.2 **Research and Development**	Policy document and processes for research and development
	List of activities which involve research, scholarly activity and education
	List of facilities for research and development
	List of research and development activities that trainees and academic staff participated
	Minutes of recent meeting regarding research and development
	Evidence on the action taken to enhance research activities in the faculty/ school
	Documents on the policy of educational expertise
	Evidence of activities which involves educational expertise
	Documents on the policy and process of budgeting and resource allocation
5.3 **Financial Resources**	Evidence on the budgetary system of faculty/school, eg allocation of funds for training and education activities.
	Minutes of recent meetings regarding budgeting and resourse allocation
	Audited financial statements or certified supporting documents for the last three consecutive years.

AREA 6: PROGRAMME MANAGEMENT	SOURCES OF EVIDENCE
6.1 Programme Management	Documents or policies on ETP's governance and quality management systems.
	Document or faculty/school strategic plan
	Organisational charts and functional charts
	Minutes of recent faculty/school meetings
	Evidence on the process of relevant decision-making in the faculty/school/organisation with examples
	Term of reference for appointment of academic leadership
	Letters of appointments and terms of reference for curriculum committee, exam committee, vetting committee
	Minutes of recent heads of department, programme committees meeting
	Evidence of faculty/school was given adequate autonomy in terms of policymaking
	Terms of reference of governance between main campus/training site and branch campuses/training sites
	List of stakeholders involved in programme management and their roles
	Minutes of recent programme committee meeting with relevant stakeholders
	Meeting of with Dean/head of faculty/school and programme coordinator with relevant stakeholders
6.2 Programme Leadership (SSR)	List of criteria for appointment of academic leadership
	Evidence on selection, appointment and evaluation of academic leadership
	Document on job description and CV of academic leadership
	List of responsibilities and roles of academic leadership in terms of recruitment and training, trainee admission and allocation of resources and decision-making processes
	Meetings of meeting with programme leaders and academic staff
	Records of appraisal for programme leaders
	List of criteria for appraisal
	Evidence of innovation and creativity in faculty/school
6.3 Administrative Staff	List of administrative staff
	Terms of reference for appointment of administrative staff
	List of roles and responsibilities of administrative staff
	Records of appraisal for administrative staff
	Records of training and performance review of administrative staff
	Meeting with administrative staff
	List of training provided for administrative staff

	Documents on human resources development plans
	Evidence of training need identification and training need analysis
6.4 **Academic Records**	Documents on procedures and processes for security of academic records
	Sample of/ access to academic records and the system used by faculty/school
	Minutes of recent meetings regarding the academic records
	Policies on data security and cybersecurity including individual information and confidential records
	List of the relevant persons-in charge of academic records
	ETP/department's risk assessment and treatment plans for information systems and data security including examination security matters
	ETP's quality management or quality assurance systems (manuals and/or selected documented procedures).

AREA 7: PROGRAMME MONITORING, REVIEW AND CONTINUAL QUALITY IMPROVEMENT	**SOURCES OF EVIDENCE**
7.1 **Mechanisms for Programme Monitoring, Review and Continual Quality Improvement**	Documents on the policies and processes/mechanisms for monitoring of programme
	Documents on the policies and processes/mechanisms reviewing the programme
	List of internal and external stakeholders involved in programme monitoring and review
	Appointment letters and terms of reference of principal stakeholders in programme review
	Meeting minutes of programme monitoring and review committee
	Reports of programme monitoring and review eg. report from Industrial Advisory Panel (IAP) / External Examiner (EE)
	Report on action taken on recommendations of external stakeholders, advisors, examiners (where applicable)
	Organisational structure and links between ETP quality centre and school/faculty eg. ETP's organisation chart showing the position of its QA unit, Department's organisation chart showing the position of its QA unit/personnel.
	Example of services offered by quality management centre/unit
	Meeting minutes of the department's QA unit. ETP's and/or Department's QA or quality reports

Documents on the processes of internal quality management system and parties involved
Appointment letters of members of programme advisory panel (PAP) from among external experts, alumni, employers and/or from industry/stakeholder representatives.
Evidence on the implementation of quality assurance process of the programme, eg. minutes of meetings between the ETP/department and the PAP.
Letters of appointment and job descriptions of PIC for quality at the faculty/school
Documents on the qualification and experience of persons in-charge of quality assurance
Evidence of the implementation of quality assurance culture in the faculty/school
Memorandum of Understandings or Agreement in collaborative arrangements
Course evaluation by trainees
Working paper of the curriculum review and approval by HEP's Senate/Academic Board.